Problems We Can Solve With a Helper

Haim H. Permuter Stanford haim1@stanford.edu Yossef Steinberg Technion ysteinbe@ee.technion.ac.il Tsachy Weissman Stanford/Technion weissman@ee.technion.ac.il

Problem Formulation

Rate-Distortion with common rate-limited helper

- Problem Formulation
- Rate-Distortion with common rate-limited helper
 - Previous work

- Problem Formulation
- Rate-Distortion with common rate-limited helper
 - Previous work
 - The rate-distortion region, and important observations

- Problem Formulation
- Rate-Distortion with common rate-limited helper
 - Previous work
 - The rate-distortion region, and important observations
- Independent helper rates

- Problem Formulation
- Rate-Distortion with common rate-limited helper
 - Previous work
 - The rate-distortion region, and important observations
- Independent helper rates
- Helper with side information at the decoder

- Problem Formulation
- Rate-Distortion with common rate-limited helper
 - Previous work
 - The rate-distortion region, and important observations
- Independent helper rates
- Helper with side information at the decoder
- Cascade rate-distortion with a helper

- Problem Formulation
- Rate-Distortion with common rate-limited helper
 - Previous work
 - The rate-distortion region, and important observations
- Independent helper rates
- Helper with side information at the decoder
- Cascade rate-distortion with a helper
- Examples







B. Independent













3. The destination constructs an estimate \hat{X}^n , based on *T* and *T'*.

Problem Formulation (cont'd)



(R, R', D).

Problem Formulation (cont'd)



achievable.

Permuter, Steinberg, Weissman, ITW 2009 Volos.

Previous Work

Lossless source coding with rate-limited SI at the decoder(s)

OutlineProblem Formulation

Common Rate-Limited Helper
Previous Work

Rate-distortion region

Independent Rates

Helper With Decoder SI

Independent Rates & Decoder SI

Cascade Rate-Distortion With a Helper

Summary

END

Wyner 75.

Ahlswede and Körner, 75

Lossy source coding with SI at the decoder

Wyner and Ziv, 76.

Rate-distortion for correlated sources with partially separated encoders

Kaspi, Ph.D. dissertation, 79.

Kaspi and Berger, IEEE IT 1982.

Subsumes all previous models.

Cooperative source coding with encoder breakdown, Dinkar Vasudevan and Etienne Perron, ISIT 2007, Nice. Outline Problem Formulation Common Rate-Limited Helper Previous Work Rate-distortion region Independent Rates Helper With Decoder SI Independent Rates & Decoder SI Cascade Rate-Distortion With a Helper Summary END

The Kaspi and Berger model:



END

The Kaspi and Berger model:



The Kaspi and Berger model:



The rate-distortion region with common messages



The rate-distortion region with common messages



 $P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{\hat{X}|U,X}.$











$$P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{\hat{X}|U,X}.$$

Converse

▶ Outline	In
Problem Formulation	
	Do
Common Rate-Limited Helper	
Previous Work	
Rate-distortion region	
Independent Rates	
Helper With Decoder SI	
Independent Rates & Decoder	
SI	
Cascade Rate-Distortion With a	
Helper	
Summary	
END	

In most converse proofs, the main issue is to get the Markov conditions.

Do we really need them?

Converse

Outline	
Problem Formulation	Do we really nee
Common Rate-Limited Helper	_ • · · • · • • · · • · · · · · · · · ·
Previous Work	
► Rate-distortion region	R'
Independent Rates	E
	1
Helper With Decoder SI	
	L
Independent Rates & Decoder	
SI	
Cascade Rate-Distortion With a	
Helper	
Summary	
END	

In most converse proofs, the main issue is to get the Markov conditions. Do we really need them?

R'	\geq	I(U;Y)	$U - Y - (X, \hat{X})$
R	\geq	$I(X; \hat{X} U)$	$\hat{X} - (U,X) - Y$
D	\geq	$\mathbb{E}d(X, \hat{X})$	(*)

Converse

Outline
Problem Formulation
Common Rate-Limited Helper
Previous Work
Rate-distortion region
Independent Rates
Helper With Decoder SI
Independent Rates & Decoder SI
SI
Cascade Rate-Distortion With a Helper

Summary

END

In most converse proofs, the main issue is to get the Markov conditions. Do we really need them?

 $R' \geq I(U;Y) \qquad U - Y - (X,\hat{X})$ $R \geq I(X;\hat{X}|U) \qquad \hat{X} - (U,X) - Y$ $D \geq \mathbb{E}d(X,\hat{X}) \qquad (*)$

• $\hat{X}^n(j), j = 1, 2...$ are generated conditioned on U^n .

 U^n is known at both sides.
Converse

▶Outline	In m
Problem Formulation	
	Do w
Common Rate-Limited Helper	
Previous Work	
Rate-distortion region	
Independent Rates	
Helper With Decoder SI	
Independent Rates & Decoder	
SI	
Cascade Rate-Distortion With a	$\hat{\mathbf{X}}$
Helper	• Z I
Summary	U'
END	, <u> </u>
EIND	

In most converse proofs, the main issue is to get the Markov conditions. Do we really need them?

R'	\geq	I(U;Y)	$U - Y - (X, \hat{X})$
R	\geq	$I(X; \hat{X} U)$	$\hat{X} - (U, X) - Y$
D	\geq	${\rm I\!E} d(X, \hat{X})$	(*)

 $\hat{X}^{n}(j), j = 1, 2...$ are generated conditioned on U^{n} .

 U^n is known at both sides.

• The specific codeword $\hat{X}^n(i)$ is chosen typical with X^n .

Converse

▶ Outline	In m
Problem Formulation	
	Do
Common Rate-Limited Helper	
Previous Work	
Rate-distortion region	
Independent Rates	
Helper With Decoder SI	
Independent Rates & Decoder	
SI	
Cascade Rate-Distortion With a	X
Helper	* 21
Summary	U
END	·

In most converse proofs, the main issue is to get the Markov conditions. Do we really need them?

 $R' \geq I(U;Y) \qquad U - Y - (X,\hat{X})$ $R \geq I(X;\hat{X}|U) \qquad \hat{X} - (U,X) - Y$ $D \geq \mathbb{E}d(X,\hat{X}) \qquad (*)$

 $\hat{X}^{n}(j), \ j = 1, 2...$ are generated conditioned on U^{n} . U^{n} is known at both sides.

• The specific codeword $\hat{X}^n(i)$ is chosen typical with X^n .

• If (\hat{X}^n, U^n, X^n) are jointly typical, the distortion $\leq D$, due to (*).

Converse

Outline
Problem Formulation
Do
Common Rate-Limited Helper
Previous Work
Rate-distortion region
Independent Rates
Helper With Decoder SI
Independent Rates & Decoder SI
Cascade Rate-Distortion With a Helper
Summary
END

In most converse proofs, the main issue is to get the Markov conditions. Do we really need them?

 $R' \geq I(U;Y) \qquad U - Y - (X, \hat{X})$ $R \geq I(X; \hat{X}|U) \qquad \hat{X} - (U, X) - Y$ $D \geq \mathbb{E}d(X, \hat{X}) \qquad (*)$

\$\hat{X}^n(j)\$, \$j = 1, 2...\$ are generated conditioned on \$U^n\$.
 \$U^n\$ is known at both sides.

• The specific codeword $\hat{X}^n(i)$ is chosen typical with X^n .

• If (\hat{X}^n, U^n, X^n) are jointly typical, the distortion $\leq D$, due to (*).

 $\implies P_{\hat{X},U,X,Y}$ need not be kept. Only $P_{\hat{X},U,X}$.

Another way of saying the same thing: Let

 $\tilde{P}_{\hat{X},U,X,Y} = P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{\hat{X}|U,X,Y}$ $P_{\hat{X},U,X,Y} = P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{\hat{X}|U,X}$

with $P_{\hat{X}|U,X}$ the conditional marginal induced by $\tilde{P}_{\hat{X},U,X,Y}$.

Independent Rates

Previous WorkRate-distortion region

Problem Formulation

Common Rate-Limited Helper

Outline

Helper With Decoder SI

Independent Rates & Decoder SI

Cascade Rate-Distortion With a Helper

Summary

END

Another way of saying the same thing: Let

OutlineProblem Formulation	$\tilde{P}_{\hat{X},U,X,Y} = P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{U Y} \cdot P_{\hat{X} U,X,Y}$
Common Rate-Limited Helper Previous Work Rate-distortion region 	$P_{\hat{X},U,X,Y} = P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{U Y} \cdot P_{\hat{X} U,X}$ with $P_{\hat{X} U,V}$ the conditional marginal induced by $\tilde{P}_{\hat{X}}$ is used.
Independent Rates	The region
Helper With Decoder SI Independent Rates & Decoder	$B' > I(U \cdot V)$
SI	$R \geq I(0, 1)$ $R \geq I(X; \hat{X} U)$
Cascade Rate-Distortion With a Helper	$D \geq \mathbb{E}d(X, \hat{X})$
Summary	
END	is the same under P and P .

Another way of saying the same thing: Let

OutlineProblem Formulation	$\tilde{P}_{\hat{X},U,X,Y} = P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{U Y} \cdot P_{\hat{X} U,X,Y}$
Common Rate-Limited Helper Previous Work Rate-distortion region	$P_{\hat{X},U,X,Y} = P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{U Y} \cdot P_{\hat{X} U,X}$ with $P_{\hat{X} U,X}$ the conditional marginal induced by $\tilde{P}_{\hat{X}}$
Independent Rates	The region
Independent Rates & Decoder SI	$R' \geq I(U;Y)$
Cascade Rate-Distortion With a Helper	$R \geq I(X; \hat{X} U)$ $D \geq \mathbb{E}d(X, \hat{Y})$
Summary	is the same under P and \tilde{P} .
	Thus, it is enough to prove:
	Achievability for any $P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{U Y} \cdot P_{\hat{X} U,X}$ Upper bound for $P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{U Y} \cdot P_{\hat{X} U,X}$

Permuter, Steinberg, Weissman, ITW 2009 Volos.











 $R' \ge I(U;Y) + I(V;Y|U,X), \quad (U,V) - Y - X.$



 $R' \ge I(U;Y) + I(V;Y|U,X), \quad (U,V) - Y - X.$

But in our result, we have only $R' \ge I(U; Y)$.

A Second Look at the Helper (cont'd)



END

A Second Look at the Helper (cont'd)



A Second Look at the Helper (cont'd)



Will he use extra rate?

















Example

Doubly symmetric binary source with Hamming distortion measure

OutlineProblem Formulation

Common Rate-Limited Helper

The region with common helper:

$$R \ge H_b(H_b^{-1}([1 - R']_+) * p_z) - H_b(D).$$

 $X = Y \oplus Z, \quad Y \sim \text{Bernoulli}(\frac{1}{2}), \quad Z \sim \text{Bernoulli}(p_z)$

Independent RatesExample

Independent Rates
A Second Look at the

Helper

Helper With Decoder SI

Independent Rates & Decoder SI

Cascade Rate-Distortion With a Helper

Summary

END

Example

Doubly symmetric binary source with Hamming distortion measure

Outline Problem Formulation

Common Rate-Limited Helper

Independent Rates

A Second Look at the

Helper

Independent Rates

Example

Helper With Decoder SI

The region with common helper:

$$R \ge H_b(H_b^{-1}([1 - R']_+) * p_z) - H_b(D)$$

 $X = Y \oplus Z, \quad Y \sim \text{Bernoulli}(\frac{1}{2}), \quad Z \sim \text{Bernoulli}(p_z)$

The region with two rates, $R_2 \ge R_1$

Independent Rates & Decoder

SI

Cascade Rate-Distortion With a Helper

Summary

END

$$R \geq H_b(H_b^{-1}([1-R_2]_+) * p_z) - H_b(D)$$
$$R_1 \geq H_b(H_b^{-1}([1-R_2]_+) * p_z) - [1-R_2]_+$$









• The rate distortion region is denoted $\mathcal{R}(D|Z)$.

OutlineProblem Formulation

Common Rate-Limited Helper

Independent Rates

Helper With Decoder SI

Common Helper and

Decoder SI Main Result

- Wall i Nesul

Observations

Independent Rates & Decoder SI

Cascade Rate-Distortion With a

Helper

Summary

END





$$P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{Z|X} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{V|U,X}.$$



for some joint distribution of the form

 $P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{Z|X} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{V|U,X}.$



for some joint distribution of the form

$$P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{Z|X} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{V|U,X,\mathbf{Y}}.$$

Markov Invariancy

Let

Outline Problem Formulation

Common Rate-Limited Helper

Independent Rates

Helper With Decoder SI

Common Helper and

Decoder SI

Main Result

Observations

Independent Rates & Decoder SI

Cascade Rate-Distortion With a

Helper

Summary

END

 $\tilde{P}_{U,V,X,Y,Z} = P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{Z|X} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{V|U,X,Y}$ $P_{V,U,X,Y,Z} = P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{Z|X} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{V|U,X}$

with $P_{V|U,X}$ the conditional marginal induced by $\tilde{P}_{U,V,X,Y,Z}$.

Markov Invariancy

Let

Outline Problem Formulation $\tilde{P}_{U,V,X,Y,Z} = P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{Z|X} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{V|U,X,Y}$ $P_{V,U,X,Y,Z} = P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{Z|X} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{V|U,X}$

Common Rate-Limited Helper

Independent Rates	with $P_{V U,X}$ the conditional marginal induced by $\tilde{P}_{U,V,X,Y,Z}$					
Helper With Decoder SI	The region					
Decoder SI Main Result		R'	\geq	I(U;Y Z)		
Independent Rates & Decoder		R	\geq	I(V;X U,Z)		
SI		D	\geq	$\mathbb{E}d(X, \hat{X}(U, V, Z))$		
Cascade Rate-Distortion With a Helper is the same under P and \tilde{P} .						

Summary

END
Markov Invariancy

Let

The region

OutlineProblem Formulation

 $\tilde{P}_{U,V,X,Y,Z} = P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{Z|X} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{V|U,X,Y}$ $P_{V,U,X,Y,Z} = P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{Z|X} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{V|U,X}$

Common Rate-Limited Helper

Independent Rates

Helper With Decoder SI
Common Helper and
Decoder SI
Main Result

Observations

Independent Rates & Decoder SI

Cascade Rate-Distortion With a

Helper

Summary

END

with	$P_{V U,X}$	the	conditional	marginal	induced b	су	$\tilde{P}_{U,V,X,Y,Z}$.
------	-------------	-----	-------------	----------	-----------	----	---------------------------

 $\begin{array}{rcl} R' & \geq & I(U;Y|Z) \\ R & \geq & I(V;X|U,Z) \\ D & \geq & \mathbb{E}d(X,\hat{X}(U,V,Z)) \end{array}$ is the same under *P* and \tilde{P} . Thus, it is enough to prove:

Achievability for any $P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{Z|X} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{V|U,X}$ Upper bound for $P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{Z|X} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{V|U,X,Y}$







"Rate distortion when side information may be absent," Heegard & Berger, 1985.



Yet, our result says: $R' \ge I(U; Y|Z)$





Conclusion:

When sending a common message to the encoder and decoder, the source encoder does not use the extra SI X^n .



Neither would he use extra rate.







Proof – Operational arguments.



Helper With Decoder SI

Common Rate-Limited Helper

Problem Formulation

Independent Rates

Independent Rates & Decoder

```
SI
Main Result
```

Outline

Cascade Rate-Distortion With a Helper

Summary

END

Theorem 4 Let $R_1 > R_2$, and let the side information *Z* satisfy Y - X - Z. For any code with independent helper rates R_1 , R_2 , there exists a code with common helper rate R_2 , with essentially the same performance (the same *R* and *D*).

Proof – Operational arguments.

Extra helper rate to the encoder is not used. Moreover, even when independent messages are allowed, sending a common helper message yields optimal performance. ($R_1 \ge R_2$).

What about reducing R_1 below R_2 ?



What about reducing R_1 below R_2 ?



What about reducing R_1 below R_2 ?



What about reducing R_1 below R_2 ?



Main idea – use binning w.r.t X to reduce the *rate* to the encoder (but not to improve the quality of \hat{Y}^n)

What about reducing R_1 below R_2 ?



$$= I(U;Y) - I(U;X)$$

Due to U - Y - X - Z, R_1 is strictly less than R_2 .





END



END

and possibly different distortion measures

$$\mathbb{E}d_i(X^n, \hat{X}_i^n) \le D_i, \quad i = 1, 2.$$



• the rate distortion region is denoted $\mathcal{R}_c(D_1, D_2)$.

Permuter, Steinberg, Weissman, ITW 2009 Volos.





$$P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{V|Y} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{\hat{X}_1, \hat{X}_2|V, X}.$$



$$P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{V|Y} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{\hat{X}_1, \hat{X}_2|V, X}.$$



$$P_{X,Y} \cdot P_{V|Y} \cdot P_{U|Y} \cdot P_{\hat{X}_1, \hat{X}_2|V, X, \mathbf{Y}}.$$



Summary

Solved the problem of rate-distortion with helper and SI at the decoder, for the case of common helper message.

Implies a solution to the case of independent helper messages, with $R_1 \ge R_2$.

• Can reduce slightly the helper rate to the encoder (R_1) , and get the same

performance as with $R_1 \ge R_2$ (but this depends on external random variables).

Solved the model of cascade rate-distortion with a helper. Here helper must send common messages; cannot play with rates.

• Have also a solution for the two way problem with a helper.

OutlineProblem Formulation

Common Rate-Limited Helper

Independent Rates

```
Helper With Decoder SI
```

```
Independent Rates & Decoder SI
```

Cascade Rate-Distortion With a Helper

Summary

END

Thank You!